

**COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE MODEL OF THE HEALTH
SOCIAL SECURITY ORGANIZING AGENCY AND THE MEDAN
HAJJ GENERAL HOSPITAL IN THE GOVERNANCE OF HEALTH
SERVICES IN MEDAN CITY MODEL****Siswati Saragi¹, Marlon Sihombing², Heri Kusmanto³, Zulfendri⁴**^{1,2,3,4}Doctoral Program in Development Studies, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Dr. T. Mansur
No.9, Padang Bulan, Medan***Email:** siswati.saragi@usu.ac.id**ABSTRACT**

The collaboration of health service governance between the Medan Health Social Security Organizing Agency and the Medan Hajj General Hospital still causes many complaints, especially from patients who are users of the Health Social Security Organizing Agency. This may occur due to poor communication and coordination between the parties involved. This study aims to analyze the quality of service governance at the Medan Health Social Security Provider Agency. The research method used is qualitative and measures quality using transparency, accountability, and participation indicators. The results showed that Collaborative Governance between the Health Social Security Organizing Agency and the Medan Hajj General Hospital has been running well. However, it needs to be improved again in Participation (Communication and Coordination). The cooperation model used leads to the Lead Organization model, where the General Hospital of Haji Medan tends to wait for instructions or orders from the Health Social Security Provider Agency and has almost no opportunity to provide suggestions and input. Efforts are needed to maximize communication and coordination in supporting collaborative service governance in the Health Social Security Provider Agency at the Medan Hajj General Hospital.

Keyword: Collaborative, Health, Governance, Security, Service.**INTRODUCTION**

Health is one of the basic needs of society, and it is essential and guaranteed as a fundamental human right. In various laws and regulations, health is one of humans' most fundamental rights (Bachriani & Wardhani, 2022). Health is also constitutionally guaranteed, implying the state's obligation to provide public services in the health sector (Wiryanan, 2016). The state is responsible for ensuring adequate health and providing facilities that enable people to obtain optimal health (Putri, 2021). The importance of health as a fundamental human right is reflected in various indicators, such as life expectancy, which can be used to evaluate the implementation of development in the health sector and improve community welfare. Health is also closely related to other indicators, such as infant mortality rates, which can theoretically increase life expectancy. The state must ensure the implementation of public services to every citizen so that no one escapes access to justice, a constitutional mandate (Listiyani, 2023). Therefore, it is essential to create fair management in health services. The concept of Governance in health services refers to the principles that

Proceeding 2nd Medan International Economics and Business

Volume 2, Issue 1, 2024

“Human Resource Transformation and Collaborative Innovation to Build Independent and Competitive Business in the Digital Era”

influence the effectiveness and efficiency of health services. Good Governance in health services involves several elements, such as participation, straightforward laws, transparency, responsiveness, consensus orientation, justification, effectiveness, efficiency, accountability, and strategic vision. In implementing good Governance, factors such as the quality and quantity of health resources, infrastructure, and facilities also affect health service activities (Harmin et al., 2023). The concept of good Governance in health services aims to improve the quality and effectiveness of health services (Syatriani et al., 2023). Good Governance has a significant impact on the quality of health services. With higher operational efficiency, hospitals can use resources optimally, reduce waste, and increase productivity. An effective management system ensures that service standards are met, including adherence to medical protocols and patient safety, improving the quality of care. Transparency and accountability resulting from good Governance reduce opportunities for corruption and fraud, ensuring that budgets are used for patient care and facility development. In addition, good Governance improves patient satisfaction due to more reliable and efficient services. Data-driven decisions allow management to make better plans, while compliance with regulations and industry standards keeps hospitals out of legal trouble. Staff development and training improve competence and motivation, directly impacting service quality. Sound financial management maintains the hospital's financial sustainability, ensuring uninterrupted operations. Finally, effective risk management identifies potential problems early and prepares mitigation plans, improving organizational resilience and healthcare quality.

In this study, researchers used previous studies to analyze collaborative Governance in healthcare. Collaborative Governance can help address health problems by integrating various actors in managing health services, including government, non-government organizations, and communities (Riyanta & Kurniati, 2019). However, collaborative Governance can increase the complexity of problems in the public sector, requiring more intensive cooperation and collaboration, including in health services (Nurhayati & Rahman, 2023). The implementation of collaborative Governance during COVID-19 is considered effective in preventing and dealing with COVID-19 as long as the resources owned by the stakeholders can contribute and provide services in handling COVID-19 (Rusliandy & Puspitasar, 2021). Several factors support the implementation of collaborative Governance, namely effective communication, trust, and coordination between stakeholders, as well as the ability to adapt to changing circumstances and prioritize community needs (Aalikhani et al., 2019). Technology can help improve the effectiveness of collaborative Governance in health services, such as by using online health services applications (Lubis, 2022). This study aims to answer some critical questions related to collaborative Governance between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital in health services in Medan City. The researcher wants to know an effective collaborative governance model between these two institutions, what factors support and hinder its implementation, and how this collaboration impacts the quality of health services provided to the community. In addition, this study will identify strategies to improve the effectiveness of collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and Hajj General Hospital Medan. This study aims to identify an effective collaborative governance model between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital in delivering health services in Medan City. In addition, this study will analyze the factors that support

Proceeding 2nd Medan International Economics and Business

Volume 2, Issue 1, 2024

“Human Resource Transformation and Collaborative Innovation to Build Independent and Competitive Business in the Digital Era”

and hinder the implementation of such collaboration and assess its impact on the quality of health services. Finally, this study aims to formulate strategies to improve the effectiveness of collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital.

METHOD

This study employs a qualitative research approach to explore the collaborative governance model between the Health Social Security Organizing Agency (BPJS Kesehatan) and Medan Hajj General Hospital in Medan City. This method provides an in-depth understanding of their collaboration's dynamics, processes, and perspectives. Primary data were collected through in-depth interviews, focus group discussions (FGDs), and direct observations. Semi-structured interviews with management and staff from both institutions gathered insights into their experiences and challenges (Rijali, 2019; Weyant, 2022). FGDs with hospital staff, BPJS Kesehatan representatives, and patients facilitated discussions on common issues and solutions. Direct department observations provided contextual information and validated the data from interviews and FGDs. Secondary data were obtained from official reports, policy documents, and previous research studies on collaborative governance and health service management. Media reports and online publications were also reviewed to capture public perceptions and recent developments (Creswell & Poth, 2018). Data analysis involved several stages. Interviews and FGDs were transcribed and coded using thematic analysis, focusing on transparency, accountability, participation, communication, and coordination. Codes were grouped into categories to identify common themes. The data were interpreted to understand the relationships and interactions between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital, identifying strengths and weaknesses in the collaborative model. Triangulation was used to validate findings by cross-referencing primary and secondary data (Miles et al., 2013). The study provides a comprehensive analysis of the collaborative governance model in Medan City's health services, highlighting areas for improvement and strategies to enhance the collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Quality of BPJS Health Service Governance in Medan

This research reviews the importance of transparency, accountability, and participation in the Social Security Administration for Health (BPJS) governance, particularly in Medan City. Transparency is crucial for creating trust and accountability, allowing stakeholders to understand the decisions, use of resources, and evaluation of the institution's performance. Clear information is needed for internal parties and the wider community, especially in the context of health services. Although efforts have been made to provide information through various media, obstacles in delivering information still need to be found, both technical and due to differences in understanding. Overcoming these obstacles requires more open and regular communication between BPJS Kesehatan, hospitals, and the public. Meanwhile, accountability is highlighted in managing health funds collected from participants. Activity reports are a means to demonstrate the use of funds transparently, but constraints such as data limitations and policy changes can disrupt consistency in reporting. Uniform regulations and a shared understanding of the rules are necessary for services to meet patient

expectations. Accountability also involves effective oversight and clear sanctions for violations. Community participation is considered crucial in maintaining the sustainability of the BPJS Kesehatan program. Despite efforts to engage the community, such as socialization meetings and complaint channels, low participation is linked to a lack of education, unclear mechanisms, and community apathy. Improving participation requires more active two-way communication between BPJS Kesehatan and the community and more structured management of aspirations and complaints. In conclusion, to improve BPJS Kesehatan's governance, more significant efforts are needed to improve transparency, accountability, participation, communication, understanding of rules, and community engagement (Regif et al., 2023).

Quality of Health Service Governance at Hajj General Hospital Medan

The study's results highlighted two crucial aspects of service governance in Medan Hajj General Hospital: transparency and accountability. Transparency is essential in strengthening public trust in hospital services by providing fast and precise information to BPJS Kesehatan participants through various media. However, there still needs to be a gap in understanding information in the community, which often triggers conflicts between hospitals and patients. On the other hand, the accountability of employees in the BPJS Health handling section is reflected through their compliance with applicable rules and regulations. They consistently follow the rules that have been set, although the process of submitting reports as a form of accountability for health services still needs improvement. There is a need to improve the quality of reports submitted to provide more transparent information and meaningful feedback to related parties. In addition, employee participation in providing input or suggestions is also a key focus for improvement. However, more motivation to reduce participation in service governance needs serious attention. Increasing employee participation in providing input and decision-making is expected to strengthen their involvement in efforts to improve overall service quality at the Hajj General Hospital Medan.

Collaborative Governance Quality of the Medan Social Security Administration (BPJS) and Hajj General Hospital Medan

This study highlights the collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and RSU Haji Medan, focusing on equity in decision-making and resolving barriers to providing quality healthcare. While collaboration is recognized, there are challenges in realizing equal participation. Issues include limited forums to express opinions and reluctance to engage due to various factors. Other challenges include difficulties understanding, building trust, competition, and limited resources that hinder equal participation and effective collaboration. Effective communication and sanctions for non-compliance are considered positive and contribute to building stakeholder trust. Hospitals need more resources, skills, and work environments, which affect service quality and patient satisfaction. Policy effectiveness depends on accurate data and stakeholder engagement, which is hindered by various barriers. Although channels for complaints and information access exist, reluctance to use them persists due to various factors, including unfamiliarity with technology and scepticism towards responsiveness. Coordination between BPJS Kesehatan and hospitals lacks clarity and organization, impacting service quality. Information provision was rated

Proceeding 2nd Medan International Economics and Business

Volume 2, Issue 1, 2024

“Human Resource Transformation and Collaborative Innovation to Build Independent and Competitive Business in the Digital Era”

positively but needed more regular coordination. The availability of adequate resources is critical to achieving collaboration goals, but challenges such as equipment shortages and budget constraints still need to be addressed. Overall, this study highlights the importance of addressing challenges in collaboration, ensuring equal participation, improving communication channels, and overcoming resource constraints to improve service quality and effectively achieve shared goals.

Collaborative Governance Model of the Health Social Security Organizing Agency (BPJS) and Medan Hajj General Hospital in the Governance of Health Services in Medan City

The results showed that the collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and the Medan Hajj General Hospital in running the National Health Insurance Program was by established regulations. Nevertheless, there are still obstacles, such as the need for coordination, routine communication, and different understanding of the rules, such as restrictions on patient care days. To overcome these steps, effective communication, evaluating problems that arise, improving coordination, drafting clear cooperation agreements, providing training and development to staff, utilizing technology, and conducting continuous evaluation and improvement is needed. The collaboration model used can be categorized as a Lead Organization model, where BPJS Kesehatan acts as the manager/leader and RSU Haji Medan as the service provider. Although this model is efficient, it can face obstacles such as BPJS Kesehatan's dominance and lack of commitment from RSU Haji Medan. Therefore, efforts are needed to increase both parties' participation and active involvement in decision-making and program implementation.

CONCLUSION

The conclusion of this study confirms the importance of improvements in the governance of health services from both the Health Social Security Organizing Agency (BPJS) and the Medan Hajj General Hospital in Medan City. It was found that transparency, accountability, and public participation are crucial elements that need to be improved in both institutions. Meanwhile, collaboration between BPJS Kesehatan and Medan Hajj General Hospital, although already occurring, still needs to improve in achieving equal participation and effective coordination. The collaboration model used, where BPJS Kesehatan acts as the manager/leader and RSU Haji Medan as the service provider, is efficient but can face obstacles such as domination of one party and lack of commitment from the other. Therefore, the main conclusion is that further efforts are needed to improve transparency, accountability, community participation, effective communication, and inter-agency coordination to improve the overall quality of health services provided to the people of Medan City.

REFERENCES

Aalikhani, R., Aliahmadi, A. R., & Rasouli, M. R. (2019). Behavioral Factors Influencing on Designing Network Governance Model in Health Care Domain: A systematic literature review. *Quarterly Journal of Management Strategies in Health System*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.18502/mshsj.v4i1.1097>

Proceeding 2nd Medan International Economics and Business

Volume 2, Issue 1, 2024

“Human Resource Transformation and Collaborative Innovation to Build Independent and Competitive Business in the Digital Era”

- Bachriani, R. D., & Wardhani, P. K. (2022). Kajian Yuridis Terhadap Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Pasien Terhadap Jasa Pelayanan Kesehatan Di Rumah Sakit. *Smart Law Journal*, 1(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.34310/slj.v1i1.548>
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (International student edition). In *SAGE Publications, Inc.*
- Harmin, Sartini Risky, S., & Munir, S. (2023). Evaluasi Tata Kelola Sistem Rujukan Kesehatan di Puskesmas Kabupaten Konawe Utara. *Media Publikasi Promosi Kesehatan Indonesia*, 6(7), 1374–1383. <https://doi.org/10.56338/mppki.v6i7.3563>
- Listiyani, N. (2023). Penguatan Pelayanan Publik, Wujud Nyata Jaminan Pemerintah Daerah Terhadap Masyarakat Dalam Akses Keadilan. *Proceeding Conference on Innovation and Application of Science and Technology*, 6(1), 244. <https://doi.org/10.31328/ciastech.v6i1.5266>
- Lubis, B. (2022). Tata Kelola Pemerintahan Daerah Yang Inovatif dan Kolaboratif Dimasa Pandemi Covid 19 di Kota Cimahi. *Jurnal Media Birokrasi*, 4(1), 67–76. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jmb.v4i1.2337>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2013). Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook. In *Google Books*. SAGE Publications.
- Nurhayati, N., & Rahman, A. (2023). Systematic Literature Review: Tata Kelola Kolaboratif Dalam Sektor Publik. *Jurnal Agregasi*, 11(1), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.34010/agregasi.v11i1.9207>
- Putri, K. W. (2021). Memahami Kesehatan Sebagai Hak Asasi Manusia. *Pusat Dokumentasi ELSAM*. <https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/ryz9b>
- Regif, S. Y., Nasution, F. A., Pattipeilohy, A., Naif, Y. I., Thamrin, M. H., & Indainanto, Y. I. (2023). Revitalizing Rural Healthcare: A Case Study of Village Maternity Cottages in Indonesia. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 18(10), 3309–3316. <https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.181030>
- Rijali, A. (2019). Analisis Data Kualitatif. *Alhadharah: Jurnal Ilmu Dakwah*, 17(33), 81. <https://doi.org/10.18592/alhadharah.v17i33.2374>
- Riyanta, S., & Kurniati, P. N. (2019). Strategi Tata Kelola Kolaboratif Antara Aktor Pemerintah Dan Non Pemerintah Dalam Pengentasan Kemiskinan. *Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.37145/jak.v2i2.35>
- Rusliandy, R., & Puspitasar, M. M. (2021). Prevention and Handling of Covid-19 in the Work Area of UPTD Puskesmas Tanah Baru through Collaborative Governance. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 3826–3835. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v4i3.2149>
- Syatriani, S., Amaliah, A. R., & Alfiana, N. (2023). Hubungan Tata Kelola (Good Governance) Dengan Kinerja Tenaga Kesehatan Pada Era Pandemi Covid-19 Di Puskesmas Binamu Kabupaten Jeneponto. *Jurnal Mitrasedhat*, 12(2), 273–281. <https://doi.org/10.51171/jms.v12i2.345>
- Weyant, E. (2022). Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches, 5th Edition. *Journal of Electronic Resources in Medical Libraries*, 19(1–2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/15424065.2022.2046231>
- Wiryanan, I. W. G. (2016). Paradigm pelayanan Publik Bidang Kesehatan Dalam Kerangka Sistem Kesehatan Nasional. *Prosiding Semnas Hasil Penelitian Hukum Kesehatan*.